

Fraser Hunter

The carnyx in Iron Age Europe:  
the Deskford carnyx in its European context

# MONOGRAPHIEN

des Römisch-Germanischen Zentralmuseums  
Band 146, 1

Römisch-Germanisches  
Zentralmuseum  
Leibniz-Forschungsinstitut  
für Archäologie

R | G | Z | M



National  
Museums  
Scotland

Römisch-Germanisches Zentralmuseum  
Leibniz-Forschungsinstitut für Archäologie

and

National Museums Scotland

Fraser Hunter

**THE CARNYX IN IRON AGE EUROPE:  
THE DESKFORD CARNYX  
IN ITS EUROPEAN CONTEXT  
VOLUME 1**

Publication supported by

**MARC FITCH FUND**



Redaktion: Claudia Nickel, Marie Reiter (RGZM)

Satz: Claudia Nickel (RGZM)

Umschlaggestaltung: Claudia Nickel (RGZM)

#### **Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek**

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

**ISBN 978-3-88467-309-6**

**ISSN 0171-1474**

© 2019 Verlag des Römisch-Germanischen Zentralmuseums

Das Werk ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Die dadurch begründeten Rechte, insbesondere die der Übersetzung, des Nachdrucks, der Entnahme von Abbildungen, der Funk- und Fernsehsendung, der Wiedergabe auf fotomechanischem (Fotokopie, Mikrokopie) oder ähnlichem Wege und der Speicherung in Datenverarbeitungsanlagen, Ton- und Bildträgern bleiben, auch bei nur auszugsweiser Verwertung, vorbehalten. Die Vergütungsansprüche des § 54, Abs. 2, UrhG. werden durch die Verwertungsgesellschaft Wort wahrgenommen.

Druck: Beltz Grafische Betriebe GmbH, Bad Langensalza  
Printed in Germany.

# CONTENTS

## Volume 1

Acknowledgements	IX
Chapter 1: Introduction, background and aims	1
What was a carnyx?	1
Ancient literary sources	4
Previous work	5
Key questions in previous work	7
Aims and structure of this study	8
Chapter 2: The Deskford carnyx	11
Description	11
The head	12
The snout	16
The jaw support	19
The lower jaw	19
The palate	21
The rear disc	24
Function	25
Scientific analysis of the alloys	26
Implications of the analytical results	29
The date of the carnyx	30
Origins and influences	31
Boars	33
Summary	34
Chapter 3: Discovery and display	35
Discovery	35
Museum history	38
The reconstruction project	41
The modern life of the carnyx	41
Chapter 4: The Deskford carnyx in its landscape and settlement context	43
Excavations at the findspot	43
The findspot	43
The ridge	52
The site's use in the Iron Age	56
Deskford within the north-east Scottish Iron Age	57
The early and middle Iron Age	59
The late pre-Roman and Roman Iron Age	60
The Picts	61
The Deskford area	62

Chapter 5: Depositional traditions in the Scottish Iron Age – metalwork and other finds	63
The north-east of Scotland	75
Rethinking prestige metalwork deposition	75
Beyond prestige metalwork	77
Atlantic Scotland	79
Southern Scotland	83
Summary	85
Chapter 6: Celtic art in north-east Scotland and beyond: the massive metalwork tradition in context	87
The massive metalworking tradition – a reappraisal	87
Distribution	89
The material	91
Chronology	99
Technology	101
The origins of massive metalwork	109
The social uses of massive metalwork	110
The development and use of decorative metalwork in north Britain	113
Metalwork in north Britain in the early and middle Iron Age	113
Regional metalworking traditions in the later Iron Age	117
Conclusions	122
Chapter 7: The carnyx in the Iron Age world	125
Identifying carnyces: some problems	125
Heads	128
Nostrils	128
Crests	128
Ears	129
Summary	131
Certain carnyces	132
Tattershall Ferry, River Witham, Lincolnshire, UK	132
Tintignac, dép. Corrèze, Limousin, France	135
Mandeure, dép. Doubs, Franche-Comté, France	151
Kappel, Lkr. Biberach, Baden-Württemberg, Germany	165
»Abentheuer«, Lkr. Birkenfeld, Rhineland-Palatinate, Germany	170
La Tène, Marin-Épagnier, canton Neuchâtel, Switzerland	174
Sanzeno, Val di Non, reg. Trentino, Italy	178
Leisach, Tyrol, Austria	184
Likely or plausible carnyces	186
Manching, Lkr. Pfaffenhofen an der Ilm, Bavaria, Germany	186
Săliște, jud. Alba, Romania	190
Staré Hradisko, okr. Prostějov, Czech Republic	194
Severeanu collection, Bucharest	195
Fragments for future study	196
Ensérune, dép. Hérault, France	196
»Carnyces« to be dismissed from the record	196
Castiglione delle Stiviere, prov. Mantova, Italy	196
Le Mans, dép. Sarthe, France	196

Discussion: the surviving fragments . . . . .	198
Technology and appearance . . . . .	199
Iron Age depictions . . . . .	202
Depictions of carnryces on coins . . . . .	202
Other depictions . . . . .	211
Discussion . . . . .	215
Chapter 8: The carnryx in the Classical world . . . . .	219
The data . . . . .	219
Biases in the data . . . . .	220
Intention . . . . .	220
Interpretation . . . . .	224
Variable occurrence . . . . .	224
Background to the groups of material . . . . .	226
The Sanchi stupa . . . . .	227
The carnryx in the Hellenistic world . . . . .	228
The carnryx on Roman coins . . . . .	231
The carnryx on Roman sculpture . . . . .	236
Public monuments . . . . .	236
Private sculpture . . . . .	244
Dating patterns and connections to barbarian groups . . . . .	247
Carnryx characteristics . . . . .	250
The carnryx on Roman artifacts . . . . .	257
Military and gladiatorial equipment . . . . .	258
Architectural fittings and decoration . . . . .	260
Ceramics . . . . .	261
Dating patterns and connections to barbarian groups . . . . .	261
Carnryx characteristics . . . . .	262
Synthesis: interpreting patterns in the depictions of carnryces . . . . .	262
Chapter 9: Carnryces, Celts and Romans: material culture, ethnicity and barbarian iconography . . . . .	269
The problem with the Celts . . . . .	269
Barbarians and their material culture in Classical art – motives and meanings . . . . .	270
Defining barbarians . . . . .	272
Material approaches . . . . .	273
Equipment typology . . . . .	274
The dataset: spatial and chronological patterns . . . . .	276
Stages of analysis . . . . .	282
Defining barbarian groups in Roman iconography . . . . .	282
Material culture in barbarian iconography – changing meanings, changing realities . . . . .	293
Shields . . . . .	293
Torcs and boar standards . . . . .	297
The draco and the falx . . . . .	297
Synthesis . . . . .	298
Implications of the carnryx in Classical art . . . . .	300
Roman visions and barbarian topoi . . . . .	300
Conclusions . . . . .	301

Chapter 10: Reconstructing the carnyx – an evocation of Iron Age music .....	303
Music archaeology .....	303
Other carnyx reconstructions .....	304
Evidence and rationale for reconstructing the Deskford carnyx .....	307
The head .....	308
The crest .....	309
The bell .....	310
The tube .....	310
The mouthpiece .....	312
Playing position .....	315
Reconstruction .....	316
Musical potential .....	317
The use of the carnyx and the role of music in the Iron Age .....	319
Music in Iron Age Scotland .....	321
Trumpets and horns in the European Iron Age .....	323
The Loughnashade type .....	323
Other metal aerophones .....	325
The »Celtic lituus« – fact or fiction? .....	328
Conclusions .....	332
 Chapter 11: Conclusions – the carnyx and the study of Iron Age Europe .....	333
The history and development of the carnyx .....	333
Phase 1: 300-150 BC .....	337
Phase 2: 150 BC -AD 50 .....	338
Phase 3: AD 50-300 .....	338
Interrogating barbarian stereotypes .....	339
Similarities and differences in the European Iron Age .....	339
 Summary: The carnyx in Iron Age Europe – the Deskford carnyx in context .....	343
 Zusammenfassung: Die Carnyx im eisenzeitlichen Europa – die Deskford-Carnyx in ihrem weiteren Kontext .....	351
 Résumé: Le carnyx dans l'Europe de l'âge du Fer – le contexte du carnyx de Deskford .....	359
 <b>Volume 2</b>	
 Appendix 1: Catalogue of carnyx depictions .....	367
 Appendix 2: Details of carnyx depictions .....	591
 Appendix 3: Uncertain carnyces .....	605
 Appendix 4: Falsae .....	611
 Appendix 5: Barbarian material culture in Roman iconography .....	629
 Bibliography .....	647



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

As the cast list below indicates, I have incurred innumerable debts to colleagues across Europe in the course of this work, and there are undoubtedly absentees in the list, for which I apologise. However, a few names need to be singled out. The support of National Museums Scotland (NMS) has been essential and freely given throughout this project both at an institutional level and by various colleagues. In particular the former Keeper of Archaeology, David Clarke, supported it wholeheartedly from the start; the staff of the library have been unfailingly helpful, doggedly chasing some highly obscure references. The Roman Society library, the library of the British School at Rome, and those of the RGZM and the Römisch-Germanische Kommission in Frankfurt were also critical resources for this work. Outwith Edinburgh, my PhD supervisor, Rick Jones, was a valuable foil for ideas and discussion, and the examiners of the original PhD thesis, Barry Cunliffe and Tim Taylor, provided a good testing of various ideas within it. The other members of the »carnyx team«, John Purser, John Creed and John Kenny, are jointly responsible for the creative fusion which was the reconstruction, one of the most satisfying projects I have been involved in; the checking and re-checking of information as we strove to make the reconstruction gathered ammunition which was a vital part of the subsequent thesis. My family and friends have lived with carnyses longer than is healthy, and their support has kept me going; the final product would have been much the poorer without the selfless help and support of my wife, Tanja Romankiewicz. To all, my heartfelt thanks. I am especially grateful to the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut for a grant which allowed a month's research leave in the Römisch-Germanische Kommission in Frankfurt; this was critical to the extensive rewriting required to convert the work from thesis to monograph, and provided the space, the amazing library facilities, and the intellectual environment to get it on the home strait.

I am particularly grateful to the RGZM for agreeing to publish the volume, and especially to Martin Schönfelder for championing this and for his support and advice through this process, and to Claudia Nickel for the hard yards of getting it into print. The text was read in full by Martin and by Andrew Fitzpatrick, who both made many useful suggestions and spotted numerous flaws, while parts were read by Vincent Megaw and Martin Goldberg, to my considerable benefit: to all, I am grateful for making me reconsider various aspects and saving me from error, though others doubtless remain.

I am also grateful to the following for various assistances, willingly rendered:

Richard Abdy (British Museum), Duncan Anderson (formerly NMS), Craig Angus (NMS), the Duke of Argyll, the late Don Bailey (formerly British Museum), Holger Becker (LVR-LandesMuseum Bonn), Brian Bedford (Earl of Seafield's factor 1994), Alan Braby, British Library, British School at Rome, Odile Cavalier (Avignon), Chris Chippendale (formerly Cambridge University), Mary Kemp Clarke, George Anderson Clarke, Margaret Clift (NMS), Dominic Cliquet (Musée d'Évreux), Alex Corney (Victoria & Albert Museum), Geoff Cottam, Trevor Cowie (formerly NMS), Anne Crone (AOC Archaeology), Ian Currie (Deskford), Neil Curtis (University of Aberdeen Museums), Mary Davis (NMS), Stefano De Caro (Soprintendenza Archeologica, Naples), Philip De Jersey, John Dent (formerly Scottish Borders Council), David Devereux (formerly Stewartry Museum), Michel Dhénin (Bibliothèque nationale, Paris), George Dickson (former Central Region archivist), Linda Drummond (formerly NMS), Katherine Eremin (formerly NMS), Keryn Evely, Stuart Fleming (University of Pennsylvania), Valerie Gillies, Kristian Göransson (Swedish Institute, Rome), Hélène Grimaud (Montbéliard), Kurt Gschwandtler (formerly Kunsthistorisches Museum Vienna), Len Hall (Cullen), Mark

Hall (Perth Museum), Colin Haselgrove (Leicester University), Andrew Heald (AOC Archaeology), J. D. Hill (British Museum), Tim Holden (Headland Archaeology), Richard Hobbs (British Museum), Dave Hogg (formerly NMS), Nick Holmes (formerly NMS), Hella Horsnæs (Nationalmuseet, Copenhagen), Flemming Kaul (Nationalmuseet, Copenhagen), Lawrence Keppie (formerly Hunterian Museum), Mike King (formerly Perth Museum), Ernst Künzl (formerly RGZM), Ian Larnier (formerly NMS), Neil McLean (NMS), Christophe Maniquet (INRAP), Andrew Martin (formerly NMS), Axel May, Jack and Margaret Mitchell (Leitchestown), Doreen Moyes (formerly NMS), Tim Neighbour (CFA Archaeology), Heino Neumayer (Museum für Vor- und Frühgeschichte, Berlin), Andrew Norval (Seafield Estate), Marion O’Neil, Ioanna Oltean (Exeter University), Kevin Parachaud (University of Limoges), Alain Pasquier (Musée du Louvre), Christophe Piccinelli-Dassaud (Musée du Louvre), the late Barry Raftery (Dublin), Val Rigby, Emma Robinson (formerly NMS), Rosa Roncador, Rob Sands (University College Dublin), the Earl of Seafield, Agnès Schéerer (Musée du Louvre), Ian Scott (formerly NMS), Ian G. Scott, Alison Sheridan (NMS), Claude Sintès (Musée départemental Arles Antique), Ian Stead, Jim Tate (formerly NMS), Anne Taylor (Cambridge University), Tim Taylor (Vienna University), Roger Tomlin (Oxford University), Dimitra Tsangari (Alphabank Numismatic Collection, Athens), Johan van Heesch (Royal Coin Cabinet, Brussels), Vincent van Vilsteren (Drents Museum), Christophe Vendries (Université de Rennes), Richard Warner (formerly Ulster Museum), Tricia Weeks (formerly Inverness Museum), Bernhard Weisser (Staatliche Museen zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz), Jonathan Williams (British Museum), Jim Wilson (NMS), Paul Wilthew (formerly NMS), U. Zumpe (Potsdam).

The work is dedicated to my parents, who have seen this project evolve from the start and have always encouraged it, but I suspect doubted I could ever bring myself to release it to the printed page; and to the three Johns, Purser, Creed and Kenny, who made the reconstruction such an exciting project to be involved with.

Abbreviations for institutions:

NMAS	National Museum of Antiquities of Scotland
NMRS	National Monuments Record of Scotland. Available online at: <a href="http://www.hes.scot/canmore.html">www.hes.scot/canmore.html</a>
NMS	National Museums Scotland
RCAHMS	Royal Commission on the Ancient & Historical Monuments of Scotland
RGZM	Römisch-Germanisches Zentralmuseum